



Arlington Historic District Commissions Final & Approved Minutes

Date: *August 22, 2019*

Time: *8:00 PM*

Location: *Whittemore Robbins House, 670R Mass. Ave., Arlington MA*

Commissioners Present: N. Aikenhead, M. Audin, D. Baldwin, C. Barry, S. Makowka, J. Worden

Commissioners M. Bush, B. Cohen, C. Hamilton, C. Tee

Not Present:

Guests: C. Roger, T. Narro, B. Melofchik, M. Malchano, S. Wikman, D. Whitford, C. Sullivan, M. Silverman

1. AHDC Meeting Opens 8:00pm
2. Appointment of alternate Commissioners: Mt Gilboa/Pleasant – S. Makowka & C. Barry
3. Approval of draft minutes from July 25, 2019. June minutes to be on September agenda for approval. D. Baldwin moved approval with modifications, seconded by J. Worden. Unanimous approval of July 25 minutes.

4. COMMUNICATIONS

- a. See attached email list
- b. S. Makowka received notice that FoodLink will be in Parmenter School building and is sending a request for a temporary sign and discussing some a/c issues.
- c. C. Greeley received email from resident asking about tonight's agenda – she sent agenda and advised Select Board's office that agenda not online even though agenda sent on Monday as required for Tuesday's posting.
- d. Letter from Town Manager regarding windows being replaced at 23 Maple Street - and delay due to receipt of replacement windows for damaged units.
- e. Application received for 0 Ravine Street.

5. OPEN FORUM

Ordinarily, any matter presented to the Commission under Open Forum will neither be acted upon nor a formal decision made, absent a previously noticed agenda item, but the Commission may make a decision if it deems it appropriate and necessary for the public good.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

- a. Central Street and Avon Place Historic District vacant commissioner seats – Beth Melofchik lives in Russell Historic District and came to introduce herself

as potential new commissioner. S. Makowka suggested moving C. Barry over to At-Large and C. Hamilton moved to Jason/Gray District seat. C. Greeley to send out letters to property owners in the Districts.

- b. Report from Streetscape sub-committee – no report
- c. Town Day Sign Up (9/14) – Carol will circulate sign up list

7. NEW BUSINESS

8:00pm

- a. Continuation of Formal Hearing for 0 Ravine Street (Perlo) for new house construction – **APPLICATION WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT.**
- b. Formal Hearing re: 23 Water Street (Whitford) for additional solar panels. D. Whitford gave presentation on revised submittal. They have opted for fewer panels as shown in provided materials. Also, as shown, conduit runs have been moved to run next to existing cables. M. Audin moved approval, seconded by C. Barry. Unanimous approval. D. Baldwin appointed monitor.
- c. Formal Hearing re: 56-58 Westminster Ave. (Sullivan) for exterior changes including deck, door and windows. W. Sullivan gave presentation. He built the house in 1972-1973. Neighborhood had various styles of buildings. This is a Duplex style two family. There is another structure sited almost in front of this building so there extremely limited visibility from any point of public view. Existing windows are aluminum sash and frame windows. Vinyl siding on west side and back of house, front elevation is cedar shingles, and on side with entrance there are cedar clapboards on the first floor and rest is vinyl due to maintenance issues. S. Makowka went page by page through provided drawings. Applicant confirmed that new vinyl windows will be identical in location and dimensions to the existing windows. On the deck to the left – framing will be fixed and Trex deck and Azek railing system are proposed. Proposed new vinyl siding is only replacing existing vinyl materials. The only real material change is going from aluminum windows to vinyl windows with PVC casing. He confirmed that the existing cornerboards shown on back of house are vinyl. The Commission noted that the existing aluminum windows do not have historic value and that the structure is not a contributing structure in the District. The Applicant noted proposed changes on the back of the house. The last page of the presentation package shows a representation of what he would like this to look like in the end.

Discussion of windows. The Applicant didn't like the options for wood shutters and if vinyl shutters wouldn't be approved, he would not put on shutters. S. Makowka said no original historic materials were used on this house. His preference would be to put casings on the windows to match more traditional look, especially on front elevation and be is against installation of new plastic vinyl shutters. M. Audin confirmed that the proposed casings are jam and headers with an actual sill on the bottom. The Applicant clarified that wood elements will remain where wood currently exists.

Regarding the entrance deck towards the front of the house, the same size deck with a new granite bottom step is proposed. Discussion about posts for deck and M. Audin said the supporting posts don't appear to need replacement so painting them out in a darker color so they recede would be preferred. The Applicant confirmed that all windows in the house will be replaced to fit in existing openings. Applicant is proposing to remove the deck on toward the rear of the West elevation (already removed) and wants to move it to the back of house. Page 11 has the plans. It is only visible at a

great distance from Lowell Street when viewed between existing houses. The proposed deck will break up the "wall" image that exists now because of the fall in grade results in so much of the foundation showing. 6 x 6 posts are required by the building dept. A skirt board will go around the framing structure of the deck but it will be open underneath. On other (East) side, the existing deck will be replaced as is but it will be 2 feet longer than existing extending towards toward the back of the house.

Rebuilding steps, putting finished risers and skirt boards on side with a proper railing system.

C. Barry moved that we approve project as proposed for changing windows from aluminum to vinyl with amendment that they received flat casings and a sill (as illustrated in the supplied materials list) and that we accept proposal to replace decks to be similar as shown with the clarification that the deck framing will be installed parallel to the wall so that the decking will be perpendicular to wall,

the under-side support elements will be painted out, and all metal hangers to be concealed with some type of trim. Also, granite step to be at base (1st step) of front deck and shutters not to be added now. Mock up shown is acceptable. D. Baldwin seconded for discussion. J. Worden wants the certificate to note that the building is considered a non-contributing structure in the District and the non-wood materials are accepted because of the unique circumstances of this particular structure and are not a precedent for any other location in the District. J. Worden abstained and 5 other Commissioners approved. M. Audin appointed monitor.

- d. Informal Hearing re: 200 Pleasant Street (Malchano) for chimney removal at 200 Pleasant Street. S. Makowka said he granted a CONA for removal of the interior portion of the chimney while maintaining/replacing exterior portion which the Applicant is now asking for permission to remove. S. Makowka confirmed that there is another existing chimney on the main, more visible, block of the house and stated that, since there is nothing special about this rear chimney, he has no problem suggesting a 10-day Certificate would be appropriate. C. Barry proposed that the removal of the rear chimney is sufficiently insignificant and non-contributing to the house and to the District that it warrants a 10-day Certificate of Appropriateness. Unanimous approval. C. Barry moved approval of a 10-day certificate for removal, seconded by M. Audin. D. Baldwin abstained and 5 others approved. Monitor S. Makowka.
- e. Informal Hearing re: 12 Elder Terrace (Silverman) for reconstruction of garage. The existing garage is adjacent to the property line, it is a nonconforming structure built in the 1920s, not at same time as house. It is constructed of concrete blocks with a flat roof and building is structurally unsound and unsafe at this point. Architect has proposed a new garage with a hipped roof to be clad with a clapboard style, fiber cement product that is acceptable to the building department. The Commission observed that the proposed structure could match the house and suggested they find out what original materials exist under the current asbestos siding and possibly match siding on garage. Discussion about a symmetry issue with the front door not being centered and trim and other materials. The Commission emphasized it usually required wood for garage doors. A suggestion was made that they include photos of other existing garages in the area that look like their proposal. S. Makowka said it looks like there is existing wall but they probably will need to do a new foundation and wall. Discussion of garage door design -- 3 horizontal panels

with top third being lites is usually the commissions preference for garage door to look more like traditional carriage house doors which would have had more glass. Back garage door isn't under our jurisdiction if not visible so they can do something different than the front.

- f. Informal Hearing re: 199 Pleasant Street (Narro). T. Narro came and discussed whether monitor can approve a potential change in previously approved materials and design. Commissioners agreed that if it's just substituting shingles for clapboards, M. Bush can approve as monitor. If he wants to do a more substantial change such as adding a flair detail, the Commission needs to see the details of the proposed alternative plan. In the end it was determined that Applicant may work with M. Bush, his assigned Monitor for some changes, but will be on the agenda for next month in case he wants to make more changes than the Monitor is able to approve.

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS

9. MEETING ADJOURNED 10:15PM

10. NEXT MEETING: 8:00pm Thursday, September 26, 2019; Whittemore Robbins House

Respectfully Submitted, Carol Greeley, AHDC Executive Secretary